

**CONTEMPORARY  
WESTERN CHRISTIAN  
PERCEPTIONS  
OF ISLAM**

by  
MAHMUT AYDIN

Eskiyeni Publications: 92

CONTEMPORARY WESTERN CHRISTIAN PERCEPTIONS  
OF ISLAM

by  
Mahmut AYDIN

© FCR YAYIN REKLAM BİLGİSAYAR SAN. ve TİC. LTD. ŞTİ.  
(Certificate no: 13178)

Design  
FCR

Press  
VADİ GRAFİK TASARIM VE REKLAMCILIK LTD. ŞTİ.  
İvedik Org. San. 1420. Cad. No: 58/1  
Yenimahalle/ANKARA • Tel: 0 312 395 85 71  
Sertifika No: 47479

First printing: March 2021

ISBN: 978-625-7673-02-0

FCR YAYIN REKLAM BİLGİSAYAR SAN. ve TİC. LTD. ŞTİ.  
Hacı Bayram Mah. Boyacılar Sk. No: 14/1 Ulus-Altındağ/ANKARA  
Tel: (0312) 310 08 60 (pbx) - Fax: (0312) 311 47 89  
Web: www.eskiyeni.org • e-mail: fcr@fcr.com.tr

**CONTEMPORARY  
WESTERN CHRISTIAN  
PERCEPTIONS  
OF ISLAM**

by  
MAHMUT AYDIN

Ankara 2021

**Mahmut Aydin**, professor of history of religions at Ondokuz Mayıs University in Türkiye. He received his PhD in Christian-Muslim Relations from the University of Birmingham in England (1998). He was appointed professor of history of religions in the faculty of theology at Ondokuz Mayıs University (2009). He is especially interested in Muslim-Christian Relations, Interreligious and Intercultural Relations, Modern Christian Theology, Theology of Religions and Religious Pluralism. His many books include *From Monologue to Dialogue* (2001), *Is Jesus God or Humanbeing* (2002), *Historical Jesus: From Krygmatic Christ to the historical Jesus* (2002), *What Happened to Jesus*, (2011), *History of Religions* (2018).

## **LIST OF MAIN ABBREVIATIONS**

AJISS	:	American Journal of Islamic Social Science
BHMIIS	:	Bulletin of the Henry Martin Institute of Islamic Studies
CD	:	Current Dialogue
DG	:	The Drew Gateway
EAPR	:	East Asian Pastoral Review
EQ	:	The Evangelical Quarterly
FE	:	Foreign Affairs
HI	:	Hamdard Islamicus
HJ	:	The Hibbert Journal
IBMR	:	International Bulletin of Missionary Research
IC	:	Islamic Culture
ICMR	:	Islam and Christian-Muslim Relations
IJMES	:	International Journal of Middle East Studies
IMA	:	Islam and the Modern Age
IRM	:	International Review of Mission
JAAR	:	Journal of the American Academy of Religion
JES	:	Journal of Ecumenical Studies
MT	:	Modern Theology
MW	:	The Muslim World
NS	:	New Statesman
NTR	:	New Theology Review
PISAI	:	Pontificio Instituto di Studi Arabi e d'Islamistica
PMVB	:	Pro Mundi Vita Bulletin
OCP	:	Oriente Christiana Periodica
RS	:	Religious Studies
SID	:	Studies in Interreligious Dialogue
SJRS	:	Scottish Journal of Religious Studies
SJT	:	Scottish Journal of Theology
SM	:	Studia Missionalia
TJT	:	Toronto Journal of Theology
ZMR	:	Zeitschrift für Missionswissenschaft und Religionswissenschaft



## TABLE OF CONTENTS

<b>LIST OF MAIN ABBREVIATIONS</b> .....	5
<b>PREFACE TO THE SECOND EDITION</b> .....	11
<b>ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS</b> .....	13
<b>INTRODUCTION</b> .....	15
<i>Scope Of The Study</i> .....	16
<i>Outline Of The Study</i> .....	18
<i>Objective Of The Study</i> .....	20
<i>A Personal Comment</i> .....	20

### CHAPTER ONE

#### **THE CATHOLIC CHURCH'S TEACHING ABOUT NON-CHRISTIANS IN GENERAL AND MUSLIMS IN PARTICULAR WITH SPECIAL REFERENCE TO THE SECOND VATICAN COUNCIL** .....

1.1. Introduction .....	23
1.2. A Brief History Of Catholic Teaching Until Vatican Ii .....	23
1.3. Theological Interpretation Of Non-Christian Religions .....	28
1.3.1. Louis Massignon And Karl Rahner .....	28
1.4. The Second Vatican Council And Non-Christian Religions .....	34
1.4.1. <i>Nostra Aetate</i> .....	36
1.5. The Second Vatican Council And Muslims .....	40
1.5.1. Muslim Doctrine Of God .....	40
1.5.2. Our Common Father Abraham .....	43
1.5.3. Muslim Veneration Of Jesus And Mary .....	45
1.5.4. Eschatological Beliefs Of Muslims .....	46
1.5.5. Religious And Moral Life Of Muslims .....	46
1.5.6. Salvation Of Muslims .....	48
1.6. Salvation Within Non-Christian Religions .....	51
1.7. An Assessment Of The Teaching Of The Second Vatican Council .....	54
1.8. Conclusion .....	57

### CHAPTER TWO

#### **POST VATICAN II DEVELOPMENTS IN THE CATHOLIC CHURCH'S TEACHING ON NON-CHRISTIAN RELIGIONS IN GENERAL AND MUSLIMS IN PARTICULAR** .....

2.1. Introduction .....	59
2.2. The Establishment Of The Secretariat For Non-Christian Religions .....	59
2.2.1. The Period Of Cardinal Marella [1965-1973] .....	61
2.2.2. The Period Of Cardinal Pignedoli [1973-1980] .....	63
2.2.3. The Period Of Archbishop Jadot [1980-1984] .....	65
2.2.4. The Period Of Cardinal Arinze [1984- ] .....	66
2.3. Pope Paul Vi And His Dialogue Activities [1963-1978] .....	68
2.3.1. <i>Ecclesiam Suam</i> .....	69
2.3.2. <i>Evangelii Nuntiandi</i> .....	70
2.4. Pope John Paul Ii And His Dialogue Activities .....	73
2.4.1. Encyclicals .....	73
2.4.1.1. <i>Redemptor Hominis</i> .....	74
2.4.1.2. <i>Redemptoris Missio</i> .....	74

2.4.2. Addresses To Christian And Non-Christian Religious Leaders -----	78
2.4.3. Pope John Paul II's Statements Concerning Muslims -----	79
2.5. Guidelines For Dialogue Between Christians And Muslims -----	82
2.6. The Documents Of The Secretariat Concerning The Relationship Between Mission, Proclamation And Dialogue -----	84
2.6.1. Dialogue And Mission -----	85
2.6.2. Dialogue And Proclamation -----	88
2.7. Assessment Of Post-Vatican II Developments -----	94
2.8. Conclusion -----	96

**CHAPTER THREE**

**OFFICIAL TEACHING OF THE WORLD COUNCIL OF CHURCHES ON  
PEOPLE OF OTHER FAITHS IN GENERAL AND MUSLIMS IN PARTICULAR--99**

3.1. INTRODUCTION -----	99
3.2. BRIEF HISTORY OF THE IDEA OF DIALOGUE IN THE ECUMENICAL MOVEMENT -----	100
3.2.1. Karl Barth and Hendrik Kraemer -----	103
3.3. CHRISTIANITY AND NON-CHRISTIAN RELIGIONS IN THE 1960S -----	105
3.3.1. The Kandy Consultation [1967] -----	107
3.3.2. The Developments after Kandy -----	111
3.4. DIALOGUE WITH PEOPLE OF LIVING FAITHS -----	114
3.4.1. Addis Ababa Meeting -----	115
3.4.2. "Interim Guidelines and Policy Statement" -----	116
3.4.3. Dialogue Activities of the WCC after The Establishment of DFI -----	118
3.4.3.1. The Nairobi Meeting [1975] -----	121
3.4.3.2. The Chambesy Meeting [1976] -----	124
3.4.4. The Consultation Of Chiang Mai [1977] -----	126
3.4.5. Guidelines On Dialogue -----	130
3.4.6. The Significant Points of Guidelines on Dialogue -----	132
3.5. DEVELOPMENTS AFTER GUIDELINES ON DIALOGUE -----	134
3.7. CONCLUSION -----	140

**CHAPTER FOUR**

**CONTEMPORARY CHRISTIAN EVALUATIONS OF THE STATUS OF  
THE QUR'AN ----- 143**

4.1. Introduction -----	143
4.2. W.Montgomery Watt -----	145
4.3. Wilfred Cantwell Smith -----	151
4.4. Kenneth Cragg -----	157
4.5. Hans Küng -----	165
4.6. Keith Ward -----	170
4.7. Conclusion -----	172

**CHAPTER FIVE**

**CONTEMPORARY CHRISTIAN EVALUATIONS OF THE PROPHETHOOD OF  
MUHAMMAD -----177**

5.1. Introduction -----	177
5.2. W. Montgomery Watt -----	182
5.3. Kenneth Cragg -----	188
5.4. Hans Küng -----	194
5.5. David Kerr -----	199
5.6. Conclusion -----	202



---

**CHAPTER SIX**
**THE STATUS OF JESUS CHRIST IN CONTEMPORARY CHRISTIAN**

<b>ACCOUNTS</b> -----	207
6.1. Introduction-----	207
6.2. John Hick -----	210
6.3. Paul F. Knitter-----	220
6.4. Hans Küng-----	233
6.5. Conclusion-----	242
<b>CONCLUSION</b> -----	245
Positive Developments-----	246
Shortcomings -----	249
New Chances For Future Dialogue -----	251
A Muslim Response To Christian Dialogue Concerns-----	252
<b>APPENDIX</b> -----	255
Is Inter-Religious Dialogue On The Threshold Of Bankruptcy? -----	255
<b>BIBLIOGRAPHY</b> -----	263
I- Official Documents -----	263
II- Other Materials -----	266
III- Articles And Parts Of Books-----	274



## **PREFACE TO THE SECOND EDITION**

The first edition of this work was published by The Council for Research in Values and Philosophy in 2002 in the USA. I am glad, grateful and relieved that my book is going to be published again by Eskiyeeni in Turkey. For this occasion I would like to thank Huseyin Nazliaydin of Eskiyeeni for his keen interest in the publication of this work.

While revising this study for the second edition I did not find it appropriate to touch the main argument and assumption of this study by adding new comments in the light of new developments concerning interreligious dialogue in general and Christian-Muslim dialogue in particular that occurred from 1998 to our day. Instead, I have translated one of my articles, which was published in Turkish on the occasion of the previous pope Pope Benedict XVI' Regensburg speech in which he has expressed rather offensive statements about the Prophet Muhammad and Islam by referring to the Byzantine Emperor Manuel Palaiologos II. I intend to demonstrate to our reader the present position of interreligious dialogue in terms of official Christian establishments.

Mahmut AYDIN  
Samsun, February 2021



## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This book has originally been prepared as a doctoral dissertation completed in the programme for the study Christian-Muslim Relations in the University of Birmingham, Department of Theology.

I want to thank at this place, all who in one way or another were involved in preparation of this work. I wish to express my special gratitude to my supervisor, Prof. Dr. David Thomas because without his continuing encouragement, constructive criticism, invaluable and generous assistance this work would not be possible. My heartfelt thanks also go to the head of the department of that time, Prof. Dr. Jørgen Nielsen because of his tireless efforts to keep alive and develop such a wonderful centre, the CSIC, in which I not only studied on Christian-Muslim relations but also lived and experienced it in reality. I also thank those who organise the “Dialogue and Witness” class every Wednesday afternoon and those who participate in it, because thanks to this class I found opportunity to experience Christian-Muslim dialogue in practice within the context of honesty, sincerity, mutual trust and mutual understanding.

I am deeply and humbly indebted to the University of Ondokuz Mayıs for providing generous financial support on behalf of Turkish Government to do this research and my respected teacher Prof. Dr. Ekrem Sarıkçıoğlu for his encouragement and spiritual support of me on the way of being an academician. I am also very grateful to the *Nostra Aetate* Foundation (The Vatican) and the Spalding Trust for providing me with financial support to visit Rome and to carry out some research there.

Also, I would like to express my special debt to my wife for her stimulating friendship, loving presence and inexhaustible patience and forbearance in withstanding the stress and strain starting from my PhD years to our own day. Finally I would like to express my gratitude to my dear Mother who has passed away on the 30<sup>th</sup> of July 2012. For without her great support and generous assistance I would not have been in my present position.